



**RTMG Board of Directors
Special Meeting
Thursday January 19, 2023: 10:00am - 12:00pm PST
RTMG Board of Directors Meeting Minutes**

Meeting was called to order by the Board Chair Ed Rullman at 10:02 a.m.

I. Confirm Quorum – verbal roll call – Quorum confirmed.

- a. Guests: Danny Orloff, Jennifer Zimmer, Tessa Borquez, Steve DiPaolo, Jake Mangas
- b. Staff: Laurie Baker, Julie Finck, Lisa May

Position	Lodging Property	Representative	Present (Yes/No)
Chair	Best Western Plus Hilltop	Ed Rullman	Yes
Past Chair	Hilton Garden Inn	Greg Knoell	Yes
Vice Chair	Oxford Suites	Ryan Rydalch	Yes
Secretary	Town Place Suites	Dave Creager	Yes
Treasurer	Sheraton Redding	Lindsay Myers	Yes
Officer-at-Large	Thunderbird Lodge	Jay Patel	No
Director	Hampton Inn & Suites	Bonnie Larabee	Yes
Director	Red Lion Hotel	Bobby Patel	Yes

I. Update by Chair, Ed Rullman

- a. Ed hopes that when the meeting finishes a decision is made on direction of Visit Redding and RTMG.

II. Meeting passed to Special Committee Chair, Ryan Rydalch

- a. Ryan shares that he asked Danny last week for specific bullet point items to be shared with the RTMG Board before the meeting so the board could absorb the information and formulate questions ahead of the meeting. He states that he personally spoke with many properties, not just those in this room, about the current situation with two organizations marketing Redding. Ryan states he wished the presentation from Danny had been available sooner than this morning. He is going to wait to share his opinion until after Danny's presentation.

- III. Public Comment Announcement:** Pursuant to the Brown Act, public comment is allowed during each public comment designated timeframe: one for non-designated items and one at the beginning of each agenda section for those items on the agenda. Brown Act guidelines prevent board members from making decisions on non-agenized items.
- IV. Public Comment for non-agenized items:** No public comment on non-agenized items.
- V. Presentation:** By Danny Orloff
- a. Website Analytics:
 - i. Danny went top level with analytics because he didn't know what the board wanted to see and he wasn't sure what he should share.
 - ii. Bounce rate 70%, top viewed pages are: home page, stay page, outdoor, things to do. Sundial webcam is popular with locals; he would like to add more webcams. Top areas visiting the site are: Los Angeles, San Francisco, Chico/Redding, Sacramento, Seattle, Vegas, Portland.
 - b. Leisure Marketing:
 - i. In the past 6 months: PR placement in Forbes, Thrillest, San Francisco Chronicle, Daily Beast. The Advisory Board wanted a brand presence on I-5 with a sense of place. To stand out they went with a design that didn't use photos to have more unique look. Danny mentioned that Visit Redding also does marketing on platforms such as Spotify, Google, Facebook, Instagram, Tik Tok, and Vibe. Market to: masters of the craft, adventurer, culturally curious, thrill seeker, road tripper. Showed video to illustrate the online TV campaign of a one-minute spot shown on Paramount, CBS, Nat Geo, Comedy Central, Fox, Discovery Go – received ¼ million impressions, with a 97% view through rate. (Percentage of video viewed was not shared). The top performing platforms are Facebook and Instagram.
 - ii. Future marketing focus: Danny shared data for occupancy rates for the comp set purchased by Visit Redding – Boulder is down 20%, Tahoe down 10%, Roseberg down 16% in the last 60 days, also compared with Austin, Lodi, and Newport Beach. Will do big pushes for Kool April Nites, Redding Rodeo, and water sports. Will utilize Visit California's localhood stories that get picked up on Google. He shared ideas on creating events such as a tri-tip Festival, a mural fest, and pop-up concerts. Did one with a one-day notice and 200 people attended.
 - c. Ryan reiterates he asked Danny for website analytics, outcome of campaigns over the past six months, and what plan Visit Redding has for the next six months. Ryan asked if Danny plans to meet with lodging sales teams. Danny said it is just a matter of him putting it on his calendar.

VI. Questions:

- i. Ryan asked who helped Danny with his STR comp set. Danny said the City helped him. The City of Redding compared their analysis with Austin and Boulder because they are seen as being aspirational with a similar population.
- ii. Bobby states that a 70% bounce rate is high. He asks Danny about the industry average. Danny said it is difficult to know who to judge against. Bobby comments that 25-50% is good for tourism.
- iii. Bobby shares that the Visit Redding site was at 20% when the other team managed it. That is a big difference. Danny said his developers said there were mistakes that caused the 20% bounce rate measurements. He won't get into that today. Bobby said he wants some ROI measurements. Are we doing pay-per-click or anything like that.
- iv. Ryan said they have people they pay for proactive selling. They would like to know if they are getting any traffic from Visit Redding.
- v. Danny said his developers can add pixels to see if Visit Redding traffic is getting to each property – he can work on that.
- vi. Lindsay brings the meeting back to its purpose – to see what Visit Redding does and what Choose Redding does. She wants to hear from Jake now.

VII. Public Comment for item VI

- a. Tessa shares that the hotel staff is seeing Danny and Laurie working better together now.
- b. Jake shares that he and Laurie have a strong working relationship. Jake talks about the City of Redding contract selection process. Jake feels he hired the right people with Danny and Jennifer joining their team. Jake apologizes for not being at the last board meeting. When Laurie was at the helm there was one brand which was Visit Redding. Jake thinks RTMG should consider phasing out Choose Redding and supporting Visit Redding and continue to support lodging partners. Redding should promote the destination under one brand – Visit Redding – with the same teams on each organization.
- c. Bonnie feels multiple sites bring a broader range of people, why can't both promote Redding.
- d. Lindsay feels it is not the best use of funds, that Choose Redding is competing with Visit Redding and there has to be a better way to spend the funds.
- e. Ryan says he doesn't care where the visitors come from as long as they come here.
- f. Bonnie, maybe we keep Choose Redding but modify its message to support the properties. When she googled it Choose Redding was at the top.
- g. Lindsay says that placement has to be paid for and it is cheaper with Visit Redding due to the site history.
- h. Ed brings up the role of SCWA in promoting the area. Our community is much larger than just Redding. Ed refers to some of the photos on Danny's presentation being photos of attractions in the UpStateCA region. Ed thinks one

brand would be the most effective with two entities promoting the one brand. Ed would like to see Danny attend Shasta-Cascade board meetings as it will be helpful to RTMG and Visit Redding. Julie should be at those meetings too. The Tourism Summit should be all three entities coming together. Ed thinks both teams have made head way on working together. Ed appreciates everyone's honesty.

- i. Jake speaks about the city wanting more diversified representation which is achieved with the Advisory Committee, which is a steering committee, not a governing board. The goal was to make sure each category had representation and not showing favoritism to chamber members.

VIII. Per Ryan's request Laurie gives a broad overview of Bylaws and the Management District Plan (MDP) which outlines how the TBID funds can be spent and that they must benefit those paying into the assessment.

IX. Bobby asks about if the only website is Visit Redding, then how much input does the RTMG have for the content on that site. Jake states that is easy to change. The city wanted a diverse advisory board, but it makes sense to add more hoteliers. Ryan asks if they understand that all the money going to Visit Redding comes from the hoteliers. Jake mentions that other point-of-interest organizations do help drive the interest in Redding. Ryan asks who is currently on the committee.

- a. Jake lists: Maria Roscoe from Rancheria, Steven DiPaolo from City of Redding, Nate from Redding Trail Alliance, Turtle Bay, Julie Dyer from the Civic, Rhonda from Enjoy, and John Truitt from VIVA Downtown.

X. Ryan shares at this point we need to close the public comment and move forward with the RTMG board only. His thought is that Visit Redding continues what they are doing. Choose Redding continues with the budget that has been created and for Laurie's team to work with Jake's team as much as they see fit, but the TBID funds don't go into one basket.

- a. Ryan asks for a motion; he admits there is duplications but that can be fixed after we get through this budget. Visit Redding can come to Laurie for funding with a presentation on how the funds will be used for marketing. Ryan motions for a vote that Choose Redding continues to operate as is with Laurie working with the Visit Redding staff as Laurie sees fit.
- b. Bonnie seconds, Ryan opens the motion for discussion.
- c. Ed asks for modification with an end date for Choose Redding. The discussion centers around when the end date should be, that the end of the fiscal year is too soon.
- d. Bobby agrees with Ryan. He was initially confused about having two websites but he has two sites that funnel into his properties, a brand site and a vanity site. They each bring a different set of people. It does cost more, but it still makes sense.

- e. Vote:
 - i. Aye: Ryan, Bobby, Bonnie
 - ii. Nay: Ed, Lindsay, Dave, Greg
 - iii. Motion fails

- f. New motion by Ryan: Choose Redding and Visit Redding continue with their own staff, but the Choose Redding team works to narrow the scope of the Choose Redding site while Visit Redding continues on as the leisure site.
- g. Bonnie Seconds
- h. Discussion: Bobby is uncomfortable giving up control because he asked Danny last year about having more properties featured at the top of the lodging page. Having one or two properties stationary at the top is not fair to the others. It has been a year and nothing has changed. If we make a motion to eliminate Choose Redding then at the end of the day, we have no control over Visit Redding. We control Choose Redding; if it is eliminated, we are letting go of the reigns. Lindsay states that is a fair comment, but Jake offered to add more hoteliers to the advisory board. Greg asks if we can have more control over the lodging page on Visit Redding or if that page can link to Choose Redding. He agrees with Bobby that if Choose Redding goes away completely then the Redding properties have no control.
- i. Vote:
 - i. Aye: Ryan, Bobby, Bonnie
 - ii. Nay: Ed, Lindsay, Dave, Greg
- j. More discussion: Dave brings up previous ideas that maybe the RTMG focuses on infrastructure and events. Lindsay states that this idea is similar to Ed's idea at the last meeting. Bobby asks where the events would be showcased. We would need a website for that work – would it be Visit Redding?
- k. Ed makes a motion – eliminate confusion – that the group gets behind Visit Redding as the main brand of who we are. Before we eliminate Choose Redding, use Choose Redding until the Visit Redding website is amplified for hotels with rotation of properties to include all properties in our community. Laurie's group will oversee the exposure of the lodging page on the Visit Redding website. Goal is to eliminate the Choose Redding site by the end of 2023 if the board is happy with the Visit Redding site.
- l. Dave seconds
- m. Laurie suggests that the Choose Redding site is a custom coded so it can do anything. What if we move the Visit Redding content to the Choose Redding platform.
- n. Ed doesn't want to spend any more money on a website, but that could be part of how we work out his motion.
- o. Ryan asks if this motion means after the end of 2023 Choose Redding name dies 100%. Ed says his motion can be flexible enough to decide later if it is fully eliminated. He just doesn't want to market toward Choose Redding or have a separate duplicate site.
- p. Ryan confirms that if we are not comfortable at the end of 2023 then we keep Choose Redding.
- q. Ed says yes, and if we are comfortable with the Visit Redding site, then Choose Redding is completely eliminated.
- r. Ed asks for a monthly update on progress for the website. Ed asks board if they want to meet more frequently. Ed asks Jake and Danny if they understand the motion and if they are willing to work in that direction. Jake explains how the advisory committee works and asks who we would like to add

to that committee. It is decided that Dave and Bobby will be the additional members. Ed asks Steve if he thinks the city will be okay with that. Steve says it makes sense.

- s. Laurie asks if Choose Redding continues to market or not?
- t. Ed states right now we have almost one year that we are still working with Choose Redding. The purpose behind this meeting is for Visit Redding and Choose Redding teams to work together.
- u. Vote: All in favor, motion passes. Jake leaves the meeting.

XI. Laurie is asked about her progress on getting the Redding government rate increased. She reports that she is partnering with other cities that have a similar government rate, population, etc. She found a formula on how GSA creates the government rate. The formula takes a 3-year average of the ADR, then drops it by 5%, and with that formula Laurie comes up with is \$111. Next phase is Laurie finding out the legal process to have the rate changed.

XII. Laurie is asked to look into how we change the rule that TOT is given back to a guest after 30 days. They should be able to keep the short stay portion.

XIII. Action Items for Board Vote – see noted above

- a. Discussion and Vote:
 - i. Future focus for RTMG spending
 - ii. Will the future focus use the website URL ChooseRedding.com, StayRedding.org, or another name.

XIV. Adjournment - Meeting is adjourned approximately 12:23pm.

Secretary Signature: _____


Dave Creager

Next Quarterly Board Meeting will be held April 11, 2023; 10:00 a.m. to 12:00 p.m. at the Sheraton Redding Hotel at the Sundial Bridge: 820 Sundial Bridge Drive, Redding, CA 96001

Pursuant to the Brown Act, non-confidential materials related to an item on this agenda submitted to the Redding Tourism & Marketing Group after distribution of the agenda packet are available for inspection with appointment.

In compliance with the Americans with Disabilities Act, the Redding Tourism & Marketing Group will make available, to any member of the public who has a disability, a needed modification or accommodation for that person to participate in the public meeting. A person needing assistance should contact Lisa May by phone at (530) 515-8485.

Participants at the Board meeting of the Redding Tourism Marketing Group are reminded to refrain from any actions or discussions which may be construed as violations of anti-trust law. Specifically, there will be no discussion related to pricing or fees, discounts, sales, credit terms, competitive practices, or market allocations. Furthermore, participants should refrain from discussing specific problems and limit their questions and statements to those of general industry practices.

